

Exhibit 22

1 UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE
2 BEFORE THE PATENT TRIAL AND APPEAL BOARD
3

4 SAMSUNG ELECTRONICS CO., LTD.,

5 Petitioner,

6 v.

7 NETLIST, INC.,

8 Patent Owner,

9
10 _____
Case No. IPR2022-00615

11 Patent No. 7,619,912
12 _____
13

14
15
16 REMOTE VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION BY VIRTUAL ZOOM OF

17 ANDREW WOLFE, PH.D.

18 WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 4, 2023
19

20
21 Reported by:

22 Ashala Tylor, CSR #2436, CLR, CRR, RPR

23 JOB NO. 5621734
24

25 PAGES 1 - 233

1 wanted to build a x64 module, then you would do 12:09	1 little bit lower performance in most situations 12:13
2 that. The other example is when four 32Mbx16 chips 12:09	2 and -- 12:13
3 is cheaper than two 64Mbx16 chips or more readily 12:09	3 (Simultaneous speakers.) 12:13
4 available, you might do it in that situation as 12:09	4 Q. Then -- 12:14
5 well. 12:09	5 A. -- power -- 12:14
6 Q. And reason number one, you are assuming a 12:10	6 Q. Okay. Then would the 64Mbx8 and the 12:14
7 x64 memory module as well as all four of the DRAM 12:10	7 32Mbx16, would they have similar power consumption? 12:14
8 devices would be used in one rank; is that correct? 12:10	8 A. It depends what you mean by "similar." I 12:14
9 A. In that particular situation, yes. 12:10	9 think generally, in the configurations that we 12:14
10 Q. So what if you are using a x16 memory 12:10	10 talked about in the last question, the 32Mbx16 would 12:14
11 module width and you are trying to build a 2-gigabit 12:10	11 be the lower power option. But there are various 12:14
12 memory -- let's take one step back. 12:10	12 trade-offs one has to look at depending on whether 12:14
13 Let's say that you are trying to build a 12:10	13 it's buffered or unbuffered and cost. 12:14
14 memory module with x16 bit width. Do you get that? 12:11	14 Q. When you say buffered and unbuffered, what 12:14
15 A. Okay. 12:11	15 do you mean? 12:14
16 Q. Then each of the x16 device would need to 12:11	16 A. You have to look at the actual loading on 12:14
17 be in its own rank by your definition, correct? 12:11	17 individual signal lines in an unbuffered device, and 12:14
18 A. Yes, that would normally be what you would 12:11	18 that may limit your options or it may limit the 12:14
19 do. 12:11	19 speed of some of your options. You have to look at 12:14
20 Q. Okay. So in that situation, when would 12:11	20 the details. In a buffered device, that's less of 12:14
21 you be using a four 32Mbx16 device organized in 12:11	21 an issue. 12:15
22 supposedly four ranks versus two 64Mbx16 DRAM device 12:11	22 Q. When you say buffered, what buffer are you 12:15
23 organized in supposedly two ranks? 12:11	23 talking about? Data buffer? Control signal buffer? 12:15
24 A. There would be a number of motivations to 12:11	24 A. Any -- any of those. You would have to 12:15
25 do it. One would be a pricing analysis. 12:11	25 analyze them all. 12:15
Page 94	Page 96
1 Q. Okay. 12:12	1 Q. In Perego's case are there buffers? 12:15
2 A. Another would be a performance analysis 12:12	2 A. Yes, in Perego's case I believe everything 12:15
3 based on the fact that having more ranks will 12:12	3 is buffered. 12:15
4 typically allow you to have more pages open at a 12:12	4 Q. And did you perform an analysis for that 12:15
5 time. Those would be the two primary things that 12:12	5 buffered DRAM as to the power consumption and the 12:15
6 you would consider. 12:12	6 performance difference for -- for a memory module 12:15
7 Q. What about power consumption? Would there 12:12	7 with four x8 device versus a memory module with four 12:15
8 be any difference? 12:12	8 x30 -- x16 device? 12:15
9 A. So the choice is two ranks -- or four 12:12	9 A. No. That would be an ordinary engineering 12:16
10 ranks of 32Mb versus two ranks. Yes, the four ranks 12:12	10 task. It would depend on the -- on the very 12:16
11 would have lower power consumption under typical use 12:12	11 detailed specifications of the individual devices 12:16
12 conditions. 12:12	12 that you were using, and it would be part of any 12:16
13 Q. Why is that? 12:12	13 engineering implementation to do that analysis. Not 12:16
14 A. Because the number of chips responding to 12:12	14 to see which one's better but just to make sure that 12:16
15 any individual command would be smaller. That would 12:12	15 both choices are viable. 12:16
16 be the primary reason. And the increased number of 12:12	16 Both choices would definitely be viable 12:16
17 available pages would be the other reason. 12:12	17 under certain conditions. You'd have to look at the 12:16
18 Q. What do you mean by the increased number 12:13	18 conditions for your particular design. 12:16
19 of available pages? 12:13	19 And as I mentioned, there are fundamental 12:16
20 A. You have one page register per bank. So 12:13	20 principles that would indicate that the x16 simply 12:16
21 in the case of four 32Mbx16, you would have 16 banks 12:13	21 involves fewer chips and has more banks, and 12:16
22 of memory, with a "B," 16 bits wide, where in the 12:13	22 therefore, would generally be preferable in terms of 12:16
23 case of four 64Mbx8s arranged in two ranks, you 12:13	23 power consumption. 12:16
24 would have eight banks -- with a "B" -- with eight 12:13	24 Q. So we're talking about 4x4 -- let me 12:17
25 page registers, each 16-bit wide. So that's a 12:13	25 withdraw that. 12:17
Page 95	Page 97

1 We're talking about four 32Mbx16 chip 12:17	1 Q. Okay. And do you know the price 12:20
2 versus four 16Mbx8 chips, correct? 12:17	2 difference per memory unit in the 2004 and 2005 time 12:21
3 A. Correct. 12:17	3 period? 12:21
4 Q. So they would have the same number of 12:17	4 A. It would have varied week to week. 12:21
5 chips and banks? 12:17	5 Q. But do you know what the general trend 12:21
6 A. No. I can see why that would be 12:17	6 was? 12:21
7 confusing. 12:17	7 A. No, not off the top of my head. 12:21
8 The fact is, if you were to use the 64Mbx8 12:17	8 Q. And ordinarily would a memory module with 12:21
9 in a x16 configuration, you would have to use the 12:17	9 two 64Mbx16 memory device perform better than a 12:21
10 chips in pairs for each access. So you would not 12:17	10 memory module with four 32Mbx16 device, assuming the 12:21
11 get 16 banks. You would only get eight. 12:17	11 bit width is x16 for the memory module? 12:21
12 Q. But if you use 16Mbx16, that will be the 12:18	12 A. In the majority of cases for these 12:21
13 same number of chips as when you used 32Mbx16; is 12:18	13 generations, I believe that it would. But again, it 12:21
14 that right? 12:18	14 may be cost prohibitive. 12:21
15 A. 16Mbx16 versus 32Mbx16? 12:18	15 Q. Okay. We've been talking about memory 12:22
16 Q. No, 64Mbx16. So the last entry in 12:18	16 modules. What is your understanding of what a 12:22
17 Table 3. 12:18	17 memory module is? 12:22
18 A. It would be the same number of chips but 12:18	18 A. In the context of these patents, it's 12:22
19 different capacity, yes. 12:18	19 typically a printed circuit board that has one or 12:22
20 Q. Okay. So -- and there are more banks per 12:18	20 more memory chips soldered on it along with 12:22
21 chip for the 64Mbx16 than the 32Mbx16, correct? 12:18	21 potentially one or more supporting components. 12:22
22 A. In this generation, that was correct, yes. 12:18	22 Q. So if you have a PCI card with memory 12:22
23 Q. So wouldn't that mean the 64Mbx16, it 12:18	23 disposed on them, are they memory modules? 12:22
24 would be -- actually consume less power per memory 12:19	24 A. It depends on the time frame and the 12:22
25 unit than the 32Mbx16? 12:19	25 concept -- context. Certainly the PCI replaced the 12:22
Page 98	Page 100
1 A. Ordinarily that would be the case, but you 12:19	1 ISA bus. And in the early days of the ISA bus, 12:22
2 would have to look at the details. It would depend 12:19	2 there were certainly memory modules that went onto 12:22
3 on -- it would depend on a lot of details. 12:19	3 an ISA bus. 12:22
4 Q. Okay. So ordinarily, if you use two 12:19	4 But by the 2004-2005 time frame, I think 12:22
5 64Mbx16 memory module, it will consume less power 12:19	5 the intent, or the usage of that term in the '912 12:23
6 than a memory module with four 32Mbx16 devices, 12:19	6 patent seems to be consistent with a memory module 12:23
7 assuming that the module bit width is 16. 12:19	7 that was intended to go into a dedicated memory slot 12:23
8 Does that sound right? 12:19	8 and not a general-purpose IO slot. 12:23
9 A. Again, it depends on the details, but that 12:19	9 Q. Okay. So like by 2004-2005 time period, 12:23
10 would ordinarily be the case or most commonly be the 12:20	10 if a person of ordinary skill in the art at one time 12:23
11 case. The reason one would not do that is it might 12:20	11 was talking about memory module, they are thinking 12:23
12 cost 10 times as much at certain points in the 12:20	12 about a printed circuit board that's going to be 12:23
13 product cycle. 12:20	13 inserted into a memory slot rather than a 12:23
14 Q. Okay. But once they both get to the mass 12:20	14 general-purpose bus slot. 12:23
15 production phase, the memory cost would at least be 12:20	15 Does that sound right? 12:23
16 comparable, if not cheaper, for the 64Mbx16; is that 12:20	16 MR. CHANDLER: Objection. Form. 12:23
17 right? 12:20	17 THE WITNESS: I think that would be the 12:23
18 A. At some point that usually happens, but 12:20	18 most common, but I think they would be familiar with 12:23
19 it's not necessarily when they both meet -- hit mass 12:20	19 both. 12:23
20 production. Because it could be that still that the 12:20	20 BY MS. ZHONG: 12:23
21 yields are lower. On the -- on the higher-density 12:20	21 Q. I'm just asking you, when a person of 12:24
22 device, the tooling is more expensive. At some 12:20	22 ordinary skill in the art hear the word "memory 12:24
23 point, historically prices have always crossed over. 12:20	23 module," what would they understand it to be? 12:24
24 But it's not always at the point where they both 12:20	24 A. I think they'd look for context. And in 12:24
25 reach mass production. 12:20	25 the context of the '912 patent, I think that they 12:24
Page 99	Page 101

1 are looking for something that would go into a 12:24	1 Q. And when would you use lower-density 12:28
2 dedicated memory slot. But in another context, they 12:24	2 memory devices instead of high-density memory 12:28
3 may be looking for something broader. 12:24	3 devices? 12:28
4 Q. And in what context would they understand 12:24	4 A. There could be a number of reasons. But 12:28
5 it to be something broader? 12:24	5 primarily it's either because you get a lower cost 12:28
6 A. There are many historical systems I can 12:24	6 per unit or you have improved availability. 12:28
7 think of. The VME bus computers. The IDE bus 12:24	7 Q. When you say "lower cost per unit," what's 12:28
8 computers in which memory modules were commonly 12:24	8 a unit, memory unit? 12:28
9 placed in general-purpose slots. Again, I think it 12:24	9 A. Yeah, unit of storage. 12:28
10 just depends on what the context of the system is. 12:24	10 Q. And when wouldn't you use rank 12:29
11 Q. And when you say VME bus computers, IDE 12:24	11 multiplication? 12:29
12 bus computers, those were old computer systems 12:24	12 A. There's a number of considerations. If 12:29
13 predating -- before like 2000; is that correct? 12:25	13 you wanted to use a small number of memory devices 12:29
14 A. They were predominantly before 2000. They 12:25	14 and that was your cheapest approach, that could be a 12:29
15 were still in use in 2000, but they weren't popular. 12:25	15 reason not to use rank multiplication. 12:29
16 Q. Would they have been phased out by the 12:25	16 If you wanted to build a very simple 12:29
17 2007-2008 time period? 12:25	17 device that had the smallest amount of additional 12:29
18 A. I don't know. They wouldn't have been 12:25	18 logic on the DIMM, that could be motivation. 12:29
19 common on desktops, but they survived for a long 12:25	19 But again, usually the motivation is total 12:30
20 time in -- in industrial applications. 12:25	20 cost per unit memory, which can change over time. 12:30
21 Q. '912 deals with the concept of rank 12:26	21 So often in the late stages of a generation of 12:30
22 multiplication, correct? 12:26	22 memory devices, you can build a complete DIMM with 12:30
23 A. It does. 12:26	23 one or two or four or eight devices in a single rank 12:30
24 Q. When is rank multiplication used? 12:26	24 cheaply. And at that point, rank multiplication may 12:30
25 Let me withdraw and reask. 12:26	25 not solve the problem for certain customers. 12:30
Page 102	Page 104
1 When would a person of ordinary skill in 12:26	1 Q. But if you have -- but if there's only a 12:30
2 the art apply the rank multiplication concept? 12:26	2 single device per rank, would cost still be a 12:30
3 A. Whenever they had any reason to use a 12:26	3 consideration? 12:31
4 larger number of low-density memory devices instead 12:26	4 A. Could be. So, for example, if I'm -- if 12:31
5 of a smaller number of high-density devices, or in 12:26	5 I'm making computers for 3rd graders and I can have 12:31
6 some cases where only the devices -- where there's 12:26	6 them run the software using a one-rank, one-device 12:31
7 not a distinction in terms of density but there's a 12:26	7 memory system, that could be very cheap and 12:31
8 distinction in terms of availability. 12:26	8 effective. 12:31
9 Q. When you say "availability," what 12:27	9 Q. Why would you even have a memory module if 12:31
10 availability? 12:27	10 there's only a single device per rank? Can't you 12:31
11 A. In other words, if I have two kinds of 12:27	11 just connect the DRAM directly to the memory system? 12:31
12 memories that have the same density. And I could 12:27	12 A. You can, but there are many reasons why 12:31
13 potentially use one without rank multiplication and 12:27	13 you may not want to. One of those may be you want 12:31
14 one with rank multiplication. But the one that 12:27	14 to repurpose the same computer system for different 12:32
15 would be used without rank multiplication isn't 12:27	15 markets. So you may want to have a version with 12:32
16 available in the quantities that I need. Then I 12:27	16 more memory that you sell to 6th graders than the 12:32
17 could use the rank multiplication instead. 12:27	17 one that you sell to 3rd graders. 12:32
18 Q. So for commodity SDRAMs, the second reason 12:27	18 Another version -- reason may be, as you 12:32
19 for availability is less of a concern; is that 12:27	19 said, memory tends to be a commodity so you don't 12:32
20 correct? 12:27	20 want to commit to a particular chip at the time that 12:32
21 A. No. Historically commodity SDRAMs have 12:27	21 you're making the boards. Instead, at the time that 12:32
22 been cyclical in terms of their price and 12:27	22 you sell the computer out the door, you want to 12:32
23 availability. So there are periodic shortages. 12:27	23 purchase your memory on a module just in time since 12:32
24 That's one of the things that has actually driven 12:27	24 you don't have the carrying costs to that memory. 12:32
25 variations in memory module implementation. 12:27	25 Those are some of the common reasons. 12:32
Page 103	Page 105

1	MS. ZHONG: Do you want to take a lunch	12:32
2	break right now?	12:32
3	THE WITNESS: We can do that.	12:32
4	MS. ZHONG: Do you want to take an hour?	12:33
5	MR. CHANDLER: That's fine.	12:33
6	(Whereupon a luncheon recess was had.)	
7	12:33 7 (Off record: p.m.)	
8		
8	(On record: 1:30 p.m.)	12:33
9		
9		
10		
10		
11		
11		
12		
12		
13		
13		
14		
14		
15		
15		
16		
16		
17		
17		
18		
18		
19		
19		
20		
20		
21		
21		
22		
22		
23		
23		
24		
24		
25		
25		
Page 106		
1	Q. You are familiar with this document,	01:32
2	correct?	01:32
3	A. Yes.	01:32
4	Q. Can you please take a look at paragraph 10	01:32
5	through 19.	01:32
6	A. Okay.	01:32
7	Q. Do you see there's a Table 1 in	01:33
8	paragraph 11?	01:33
9	A. Yes.	01:33
10	Q. In Table 1, follows 2, 3, 4 and 5 have the	01:33
11	headings CS0, CS1, An+1 and Control.	01:33
12	Do you see that?	01:33
13	A. I do.	01:33
14	Q. Are those input signals received from the	01:33
15	memory system in order to select the rank?	01:33
16	A. A subset of them are in some cases.	01:34
17	Q. Are those the signals that's received by	01:34
18	the ASIC depicted in Figure 1?	01:34
19	A. They appear to be with the distinction	01:34
20	that in Table 1 there's only a single control	01:34
21	signal. And in the text it explains that only a	01:34
22	single control signal is required.	01:34
23	Q. What do you mean by only a single control	01:34
24	signal is required?	01:34
25	A. Let me see if I can find that.	01:35
Page 108		
1	Wednesday, January 4, 2023	01:30
2	1:30 p.m.	01:30
3		01:30
4	MS. ZHONG: We can go back on the record.	01:30
5	EXAMINATION (resumed)	01:30
6	BY MS. ZHONG:	01:31
7	Q. Dr. Wolfe, can you pull up Exhibit 1004	01:31
8	{sic}, which is U.S. Provisional Application	01:31
9	60/588244.	01:31
10	(Exhibit 1005 was marked for	01:31
11	identification and attached	01:31
12	hereto.)	01:31
13	BY MS. ZHONG:	01:31
14	Q. Do you have that document?	01:31
15	A. Give me the exhibit again.	01:31
16	Q. Exhibit 1005. Exhibit 1005.	01:31
17	MR. CHANDLER: Can we pause for a moment?	01:31
18	My colleague got kicked out from the Zoom and he's	01:31
19	coming back in.	01:31
20	MS. ZHONG: So let's go off the record	01:31
21	while waiting for him then.	01:31
22	(Brief pause in proceedings.)	01:31
23	BY MS. ZHONG:	01:32
24	Q. Do you have Exhibit 1005, Dr. Wolfe?	01:32
25	A. Yes.	01:32
Page 107		
1	Paragraph 10, it says at least one control	01:35
2	signal.	01:35
3	Q. Okay. If you look at paragraph 11,	01:35
4	note 4, that describes what the control in Table 1	01:35
5	refers to; is that correct?	01:35
6	A. Yes.	01:35
7	Q. Okay. So in Table 1, the control refers	01:35
8	to a number of control signals that define	01:35
9	operations such as refresh, precharge, and other	01:35
10	operations, correct?	01:35
11	A. That is what note 4 says.	01:35
12	Q. And what would those control signals be if	01:35
13	the DRAM is JEDEC compliant on the DRAM --	01:36
14	THE REPORTER: I'm sorry. "If the DRAM	01:36
15	is"...	01:36
16	BY MS. ZHONG:	01:36
17	Q. And what would those control signals be if	01:36
18	the DRAM is a JEDEC compliant DRAM device?	01:36
19	A. Well, there are many different kinds of	01:36
20	JEDEC compliant DRAM devices, but a typical example	01:36
21	could be RAS, CAS, and write enable.	01:36
22	Q. Does it need to have chip select signal?	01:36
23	A. No, because the chip select signals are	01:37
24	separately defined CS0 and CS1.	01:37
25	Q. Okay. And for read and write operation,	01:37
Page 109		

1 does it also need to -- does bank address	01:37	1 correct?	01:40
2 information also need to be provided?	01:37	2 A. Let's be clear. I'm not only citing JEDEC	01:40
3 A. Again, there's nothing that needs to be	01:37	3 compliant DRAM devices. And where I do cite them,	01:40
4 provided other than something that performs the	01:37	4 it's to illustrate the obviousness issues with	01:41
5 function. But I would not expect bank address to be	01:37	5 respect to particular references. The -- I would	01:41
6 provided. I don't -- I'm not aware right now of a	01:37	6 not rely on the JEDEC compliant DRAM specification	01:41
7 situation where bank address defines operation such	01:37	7 as a way to understand what's disclosed in	01:41
8 as refresh and precharge.	01:37	8 Exhibit 1005.	01:41
9 Q. So you mean -- what about a read and a	01:37	9 Q. The DRAMs in Exhibit 1005 are to be used	01:41
10 write?	01:37	10 with a general personal computer, correct?	01:41
11 A. What about them?	01:37	11 A. Yes.	01:41
12 Q. So are read and write operation, do bank	01:37	12 Q. And we agree that a JEDEC compliant DDR or	01:41
13 addresses need to be provided in order to define the	01:38	13 DDR2 DRAM device in order to execute -- let's	01:42
14 operation?	01:38	14 withdraw -- let me withdraw and reask.	01:42
15 A. They may need to be provided to the memory	01:38	15 So the commands are for a read operation	01:42
16 chip in order to identify where the operation should	01:38	16 for a DRAM device that is compliant with JEDEC	01:42
17 take place, but they don't need to be provided to	01:38	17 standard would include bank address information; is	01:42
18 the ASIC decoder that's shown in Figure 1.	01:38	18 that correct?	01:42
19 Q. The ASIC decoder says the control involves	01:38	19 A. As I said, there are many, many JEDEC	01:42
20 control signals that define operations, correct?	01:38	20 standards. I can't generalize about all of them.	01:42
21 A. No, that's what Table 1 says.	01:38	21 Q. Okay. The JEDEC standards you cited.	01:42
22 Q. And paragraph 19 says, "The 'Control'	01:38	22 A. I would not consider the bank addresses to	01:42
23 column of Table 1 represents the various commands	01:38	23 be part of the command, no. They are supplied along	01:42
24 that a DRAM device can execute, examples of which	01:38	24 with a command, but in the -- for example,	01:42
25 include, but are not limited to, activation, read,	01:38	25 Exhibit 1029, when I look at a command like the bank	01:43
Page 110		Page 112	
1 write, precharge, and refresh," correct?	01:39	1 activate command, the bank activate command is	01:43
2 A. Correct.	01:39	2 issued by holding CAS bar and write enable bar high	01:43
3 Q. And we discussed earlier that for a JEDEC	01:39	3 with chip select bar and RAS bar low at the rising	01:43
4 compliant SDRAM, the command for a read and write	01:39	4 edge of the clock.	01:43
5 operation and activation would include bank address	01:39	5 Q. And bank address signal is supplied with	01:43
6 signals, correct?	01:39	6 those commands in order to execute the bank	01:43
7 A. We're talking about different things here.	01:39	7 activation?	01:43
8 So, one -- there's nothing in Figure 1	01:39	8 A. It is supplied to the DRAM chip along with	01:43
9 that indicates that that's a JEDEC compliant DRAM.	01:39	9 the command. It is neither part of the command nor	01:43
10 But even so, the discussions we had before were	01:39	10 is it something that necessarily would go through a	01:43
11 about what the DIMM module would receive, not what	01:39	11 separate logic circuit.	01:43
12 an ASIC decoder on a DIMM module would receive. And	01:39	12 Q. Okay. And I think you mentioned earlier	01:43
13 those are two different issues.	01:39	13 that it is not necessary for the larger component to	01:43
14 Q. Okay. I'm just asking the control	01:39	14 actually receive the bank address signal. All it	01:43
15 information of the command signals that a DRAM --	01:39	15 requires for a JEDEC compliant SDRAM is for the DRAM	01:44
16 let me withdraw and ask.	01:40	16 itself to receive the bank address; is that correct?	01:44
17 The commands that a DRAM device can	01:40	17 A. In order to use a DRAM chip such as the	01:44
18 execute includes a read operation command, correct?	01:40	18 kind that's described in Exhibit 1029, that is	01:44
19 A. It would depend what kind of DRAM device.	01:40	19 correct.	01:44
20 But that would be true for most DRAM devices is that	01:40	20 Q. Okay. So the bank address signal need not	01:44
21 there's some type of a read operation.	01:40	21 be received by a larger element?	01:44
22 Q. Okay. So let's say, since you are only	01:40	22 A. Not in every utilization of a DDR2 device,	01:44
23 citing the JEDEC compliant DRAM devices, for those	01:40	23 no.	01:44
24 DRAM devices, the commands for a read and write	01:40	24 Q. Okay. And so is there anything in Perego	01:44
25 operation includes bank address information,	01:40	25 actually mentions the bank address signal being	01:45
Page 111		Page 113	

1 passed to the buffer address -- buffer device? 01:45	1 A. Well, it depends why you have a register. 01:50
2 A. I believe all the signals that are 01:45	2 In this particular case, the register is quite 01:50
3 communicated in Perego from the host are passed 01:45	3 limited and is only used for a subset of address 01:50
4 through buffer devices. 01:45	4 signals. 01:50
5 Q. Does Perego actually mention a bank 01:45	5 Q. What about on the -- (indiscernible.) 01:50
6 address in particular? 01:45	6 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry? 01:51
7 A. It mentions memories that have banks. And 01:45	7 THE WITNESS: What about on the what? 01:51
8 it mentions specific memory types like DDR that 01:46	8 BY MS. ZHONG: 01:51
9 would -- a person of ordinary skill would understand 01:46	9 Q. On the (indiscernible) -- 01:51
10 has a bank address. 01:46	10 THE REPORTER: I don't -- 01:51
11 Q. So if you mention DDR or DDR2, does that 01:46	11 MS. ZHONG: It's on Exhibit 1032. 01:51
12 necessarily mean a JEDEC compliant DDR or the DDR2 01:46	12 MR. CHANDLER: Are you saying registered 01:51
13 device? 01:46	13 DIMM, the letter R DIMM? 01:51
14 A. No, not always. But it would certainly 01:46	14 MS. ZHONG: Yes. 01:51
15 cause a person of ordinary skill to find the use of 01:46	15 MR. CHANDLER: Okay. 01:51
16 one obvious. 01:46	16 THE WITNESS: And what's the question 01:51
17 Q. So in Figure number 1, how would the bank 01:47	17 about the registered DIMM? 01:51
18 -- (indiscernible.) 01:47	18 BY MS. ZHONG: 01:51
19 THE REPORTER: I'm sorry, Counsel. 01:47	19 Q. Okay. So for the DIMM that's described in 01:51
20 Counsel, can you speak more to your right? We're 01:47	20 Exhibit 1032 -- 01:51
21 losing you. Thank you. 01:47	21 A. Yes. 01:51
22 BY MS. ZHONG: 01:47	22 Q. -- where are the advance signals sent? 01:51
23 Q. So in Figure number 1, if the DRAM device 01:47	23 A. In the DIMMs that are described in 01:51
24 is a DDR or DDR2 JEDEC compliant device, how would 01:47	24 Exhibit 1032, the bank signals from the host 01:51
25 the bank address information be provided to that 01:47	25 computer are registered. And then the registered 01:51
Page 114	Page 116
1 DRAM device? 01:47	1 copies of those signals are sent to each of the 01:52
2 A. Figure 1 of Perego? 01:47	2 SDRAM chips. 01:52
3 Q. No, Figure 4, Exhibit 1005. 01:48	3 Q. For the registered DIMM shown in 01:52
4 A. So, again, there's no mention of JEDEC 01:48	4 Exhibit 1032, does that register have any logic 01:52
5 standard devices. But if one were to choose to 01:48	5 function? 01:52
6 implement Figure 1 of 1005 with DDR2 JEDEC compliant 01:48	6 A. Not in the way I would normally use that 01:52
7 devices like in Exhibit 1029, they would have to 01:48	7 term, no. It's simply register. 01:52
8 consult Exhibit 1029 to figure out how to connect 01:48	8 Q. How would you use -- what's your 01:52
9 them up. 01:48	9 definition of a logic element? 01:52
10 And presumably they would simply take the 01:48	10 A. Well, again, it depends on context. But 01:52
11 bank address signals directly from the host bus and 01:48	11 in the context of something like the '912 patent or 01:52
12 connect them directly to each memory device. That 01:48	12 Exhibit 1005, I would think that a logic element 01:52
13 would certainly be the simplest way to implement it. 01:48	13 performs logic functions by combining multiple 01:52
14 Q. Would the bank address information be 01:49	14 signals for the purpose of incorporating a logic 01:53
15 required to operate a JEDEC compliant DDR or DDR2 01:49	15 equation and not simply delaying a signal. 01:53
16 device? 01:49	16 Q. Okay. And what is sequential logic? 01:53
17 A. I don't know that I could look -- I'd have 01:50	17 A. What is sequential logic? 01:53
18 to think about it. 01:50	18 Q. Yes. 01:53
19 No, I mean, it's not required in all 01:50	19 A. Sequential logic -- again, you have to 01:53
20 circumstances. But if one were to build an ordinary 01:50	20 look at the context. Normally it describes a 01:53
21 PC memory module, one would -- typically at that 01:50	21 combination of logic functions and registers. 01:53
22 time, the simplest thing to do would be to connect 01:50	22 Q. What do you mean by "It describes a 01:53
23 the bank address signals directly from each memory 01:50	23 combination of logic functions and registers"? 01:53
24 device to the host computer memory controller. 01:50	24 A. I don't know how to simplify this down to 01:53
25 Q. Even when you have a register? 01:50	25 a single statement. It takes us hours or days to 01:53
Page 115	Page 117

1 explain it to students. 01:54	1 Q. Is it your opinion that '436 patent does 01:57
2 But sequential logic implements what we 01:54	2 not describe the solution for the back-to-back 01:57
3 call state machines, which are time-variant logic 01:54	3 adjacent reads with cross memory device boundary? 01:57
4 functions that can perform different logic equations 01:54	4 A. It does not. 01:57
5 at different points in time based on the storage of 01:54	5 Q. And what is a back-to-back adjacent read 01:58
6 what we call state partial results. 01:54	6 command issue that we're talking about? 01:58
7 Q. Okay. So in order to implement a 01:54	7 A. That when commonly available protocols at 01:58
8 sequential logic, normally you would need to have 01:54	8 the time, such as the DDR and DDR2 protocols, were 01:58
9 both electrical elements that execute the logic 01:54	9 used together with a very simple rank multiplication 01:58
10 function and also storage elements that store the 01:54	10 scheme, there was a problem when a read command went 01:58
11 state of the device? 01:54	11 to one rank and a subsequent read command went to 01:58
12 Does that sound correct? 01:54	12 another rank in that certain signals were driven for 01:58
13 A. It would normally -- 01:54	13 a longer time period than it would take to simply 01:58
14 MR. CHANDLER: Objection. Form. Also 01:54	14 respond or to simply provide the data in response; 01:58
15 incomplete hypothetical. 01:54	15 that there were preambles and postambles in the 01:58
16 THE WITNESS: Generally, to perform a 01:55	16 response signals. 01:59
17 sequential logic function the way that I've defined 01:55	17 And if one simply connected up two ranks 01:59
18 it, you would need both state storage in the form of 01:55	18 to be sequentially accessed, those signals could 01:59
19 a register or an equivalent, plus some what we call 01:55	19 conflict with each other. And some mechanism had to 01:59
20 combinational logic functions. 01:55	20 be introduced in order to distinguish those signals 01:59
21 That doesn't mean that the same signals 01:55	21 or to block one of those signals so that there would 01:59
22 are provided to both, or it doesn't mean that they 01:55	22 be no interference. 01:59
23 work in any particular way, but they would both 01:55	23 Q. So it's -- is it essentially a DQS bus 01:59
24 somehow be present. 01:55	24 conflict situation then? 01:59
25	25 A. Did you say d2s? 01:59
Page 118	Page 120
1 BY MS. ZHONG: 01:55	1 Q. DQS, Q as in quiet. 01:59
2 Q. Okay. What is combinatorial logic? 01:55	2 A. Let me look at the actual signal name 01:59
3 A. Combinatorial logic is logic that does not 01:55	3 there, yes. 01:59
4 store results, basically. 01:55	4 That's -- that's the -- the significant 01:59
5 Q. So basically it's -- it generally only 01:55	5 one. There's DQS and DQS bar in some generations. 01:59
6 refers to the logic operation without the storage 01:55	6 And that's where the preamble and postambles would 02:00
7 unit? 01:55	7 exist. 02:00
8 A. Correct. Generally, a change in input 01:55	8 And one of them -- either the timing needs 02:00
9 would be reflected as a change in output and a clock 01:55	9 to be adjusted between the two ranks or one of those 02:00
10 is not required. 01:55	10 DQS response signals to a read needs to be blocked 02:00
11 Again, you know, it gets more complicated 01:55	11 or they need to be combined. 02:00
12 than that when you dig into the details, but that's 01:55	12 Q. Okay. So basically we're talking about a 02:00
13 kind of a -- a very high-level overview. 01:56	13 DQS bus conflict situation, how to resolve it? 02:00
14 Q. Okay. Is that something a POSITA would 01:56	14 A. That's the most common situation that 02:00
15 have understood in 2004 and 2005 as to what 01:56	15 would come up, yes. 02:00
16 sequential logic and combinatorial logic is? 01:56	16 Q. Okay. Let's see. 02:00
17 A. They would have understood the textbook 01:56	17 Can you pull up Exhibit 1030, page 19. 02:00
18 definitions, yes. 01:56	18 A. Yes. 02:01
19 Q. You said that the -- why don't you pull up 01:56	19 Q. And you reference the Figure 8 in your 02:01
20 Exhibit 1009, the patent ending with '436. 01:56	20 discussion of the read -- the back-to-back read 02:01
21 A. Okay. 01:57	21 situation. 02:01
22 (Exhibit 1009 was previously 01:57	22 Is Figure 8 depicting a back-to-back read 02:01
23 marked for identification and 01:57	23 that's across rank boundaries? 02:01
24 attached hereto.) 01:57	24 A. So the -- the -- the simplest 02:01
25 BY MS. ZHONG: 01:57	25 interpretation of Figure 8 is that it represents 02:01
Page 119	Page 121